APPENDIX C

Public Consultation into Library Savings proposals

Rationale for the Identification of County Council Funded Libraries

- Feedback from the public consultation challenged the rationale for selecting 16
 libraries to be funded based on the fact that collectively they deliver the majority of
 library business through book loans. Collectively these libraries are based in Market
 Towns and Shopping Centres.
- 2. The main points of challenge were in the area of visits where a small number of individual community libraries showed greater performance than a small number of shopping centre libraries based upon the 2012/13 out-turn data.
- 3. Leicestershire's libraries are grouped into 3 tiers:

<u>Market Town Libraries:</u> These are the largest libraries and are situated in the larger population areas. They offer the full range of library services. They are:

Coalville, Hinckley, Loughborough, Market Harborough, Melton, Oadby, Wigston.

<u>Shopping Centre libraries:</u> These are situated in smaller population areas, but still with a defined centre such as a shopping centre. They are:

Ashby, Birstall, Blaby, Broughton Astley, Earl Shilton, Glenfield, Lutterworth, Shepshed, Syston

<u>Community libraries:</u> These are mainly in rural areas and locations with smaller populations. They are:

Anstey, Barrow upon Soar, Barwell, Bottesford, Braunstone Town, Burbage, Castle Donington, Cosby, Countesthorpe, Desford, East Goscote, Enderby, Fleckney, Glenhills, Great Glen, Groby, Hathern, Ibstock, Kegworth, Kibworth, Kirby Muxloe, Leicester Forest East, Market Bosworth, Markfield, Measham, Mountsorrel, Narborough, Newbold Verdon, Quorn, Ratby, Rothley, Sapcote, Sileby, South Wigston, Stoney Stanton, Thurmaston

- 4. It should be noted that the outturn data for 2012/13 was affected by a reduction in opening hours implemented in that year. This would have impacted on performance data as library users adapted to the changes in hours. In order to establish a robust and accurate comparison, 2013/14 data has been included because by this a reasonable time period to expect a stabilisation of data.
- 5. Table 1 contains comparison performance data and financial information for the financial years 2012/13 and 2013/14. The terms 'highest' and lowest' correspond to the highest or lowest performing library (based on ranking) within that category of library.

			2012/13	2013/14				
Туре			•			,		
,,		Community Libraries	Shopping Centre	Market Town	Community Libraries	Shopping Centre	Market Town	
		2.010.100			2.0.000	30.11.0		
				153,640				
	Lowest	4,400	44,031		3,325	36,450	97,162	
Total Annual Visits	Highest	48,133	140,613	348,117	31,325	108,659	255,660	
	T			T		т		
	Lowest	10	25	65	5	21	55	
Visits per hour open	Highest	48	80	142	36	62	108	
	Lowest	6,396	55,785	153,608	5,971	50,175	102,792	
Total annual loans	Highest	37,065	114,297	276,204	35,957	97,369	245,198	
	Lowest	14	32	65	12	29	55	
Loans per hour open	Highest	36	65	116	37	56	99	
	Lowest	216	2,367	5,931	284	2,128	5,203	
Total active Borrowers	Highest	1,541	4,587	10,517	1,443	4,182	9,710	
*Cost per active borrower	Lowest	16.81	16.34	27.87	21.90	15.87	19.07	
(total net cost per library		77.89	48.11	56.15				
divided by number of active								
borrowers)	Highest				71.28	40.50	39.66	
****	T .	25.40	40.00	22.00		T -		
**Cost per hour open	Lowest	25.48	42.82	92.03	20.25	36.98	67.88	
(Total net cost per library divided by annual opening		66.39	98.77	171.52				
hours)	Highest				49.19	73.17	114.16	

*Note: 2012/13 performance data correlated with 2014/15 (budget) as presented during the consultation

Table 1 Performance comparison between Market Town, Shopping Centre and Community Libraries Source: LCC management information

- 6. It can be seen for some measures, that the ranges of values overlap between some of the community libraries with some of the shopping centre libraries, and between the shopping centre libraries and market town libraries in both 2012/13 and 2013/14. For example, when looking at visits per hour open and loans per hour open in both 2012/13 and 2013/14 the highest performing community library shows greater visits per hour open than the lowest performing shopping centre library. Generally these will be down to specific activity in some libraries in those years that have impacted on performance.
- 7. Consideration must be given to specific circumstances in some of the Market Town and Shopping Centre libraries that will have impacted on data during 2013/14. As part of the 'using buildings better' services strategy, in 2013/14, there was significant capital investment which included investment in meeting/training rooms and

^{**}Note 2012/14 performance data correlated with 2013/14 actual financial information as presented during the consultation period.

associated equipment which required the closure of some Market Town and Shopping Centre libraries for significant periods of time and contributed to the reduction in visits as well as reduction in opening hours. It should also be noted that due to the temporary nature of these works/closure periods, staff costs were still borne within the service.

- 8. In addition to paragraph 7 above, there was also a 12 month closure of Market Harborough Library for refurbishment (as part of the District Council's plans to improve the use of its headquarters). Whilst temporary measures were put in place over the year, any reduction in service availability will have an impact on both the statistical and financial information and this should be given due consideration when comparing year on year data.
- 9. Despite the above factors it is clear that the majority of library business continues to be delivered via Market Town and Shopping Centre libraries when the average use is considered. This is shown in Table 2

2012/13												
Туре	Average	e Visits	Average	Loans	. •	e Active owers	Average PC usage					
Market Town	256,933	69.86%	211,741	66.86%	8,321	66.51%	29,685	76.85%				
Shopping Centre	89,745	24.40%	83,121	26.25%	3,251	25.99%	7,406	19.17%				
Community Libraries	21,090	5.74%	21,828	6.89%	938	7.50%	1,538	3.98%				

2013/14												
Туре	Average	e Visits	Average	e Loans		e Active owers	Average PC usage					
Market Town	195,456	67.19%	174,268	57.75%	7,324	62.55%	27,865	76.32%				
Shopping Centre	60,607	20.84%	71,014	23.53%	2,956	25.25%	7,185	19.68%				
Community Libraries	15,365	5.28%	20,869	6.92%	824	7.04%	1,463	4.01%				

Table 2: Average performance across Market Town, Shopping Centre and Community Libraries Source: LCC management information

10. In order to further test the rationale the impact on active borrowers has been considered.

Active borrowers

11. Active borrowers are those residents that choose to use library services that can easily be measured. This is done from data which shows the use that residents make of their library card when they transact with the library and covers the loan of books (including e-books) and booking of PC's. This is detailed in Table 3 overleaf:

Туре		Average Borrowers	2013/14 Average Active borrowers			
Market Town	8,321	66.51%	7,324	62.55%		
Shopping Centre	3,251	25.99%	2,956	25.25%		
Community Libraries	938	7.50%	824	7.04%		

Table 3: Average Active Borrowers across Market Town, Shopping Centre and Community Libraries Source: LCC management information

- 12. It is the book lending service that residents significantly value above all other services. This is evidenced in the responses to the public consultation where 98% of respondents valued this element of the service a great deal or to some extent and 95% thought that it was the most important. For this reason, it is reasonable to propose that active borrowers and the impact upon them is the most significant factor when deciding which libraries should be supported when funding is being reduced.
- 13. For example, Mountsorrel library is an example of a higher performing community library in terms of visits and loans per hour open. It had the highest numbers of active borrowers from the smaller community libraries in 2012/13 with 1,541 borrowers. When considering active borrowers however it reaches fewer borrowers than the shopping centre library with the lowest number of active borrowers, Broughton Astley, which had 2,367 active borrowers in 2012/13.
- 14. The following tables show the implications for active borrowers of the current proposals and the alternatives suggested for deciding which libraries should be fully funded based upon the implications for active users.

Table 4: Analysis of use based on 2012/13 actuals Source: LCC management information

Current proposals for					Jea o	16 funded libraries							upon Average	loans per	
Library	Annual Visits	Annual Loans	Active Borrowers	Active borrowers served		Library	Visits per hour	Active Borrowers	Active borrowers served		Library	Loans per hour	Active Borrowers	Active borrowers served	
Ashby	140,613	114,297	4,525			Loughborough	142	10,364			Hinckley	116	10,517		
Birstall	54,275	78,752	2,810			Hinckley	126	10,517			Loughboroug	104	10,364		
Blaby	93,757	107,458	4,587			Coalville	117	6,932			Oadby	100	9,767		
Broughton Astley	103,752	62,365	2,367			Melton	107	5,931			Market Harb	89	7,878		
Coalville	277,013	187,111	6,932			Market Harborough	103	7,878			Coalville	79	6,932		
Earl Shilton	76,901	55,785	2,436			Oadby	98	9,767			Wigston Mag	70	6,858		
Glenfield	44,031	60,349	2,579			Ashby	80	4,525			Melton	65	5,931		
Hinckley	298,370	276,204	10,517			Lutterworth	67	3,537			Ashby	65	4,525		
Loughborough	348,117	255,303	10,364			Wigston Magna	65	6,858			Blaby	61	4,587		
Lutterworth	117,363	93,948	3,537			Broughton Astley	59	2,367			Lutterworth	54	3,537		
Market Harborough	214,725	186,287	7,878			Shepshed	55	3,042			Syston	53	3,372		
Melton	253,506	153,608				Blaby	54	4,587			Shepshed	47	3,042		
Oadby			5,931			Mountsorrel	48				Birstall				
Shepshed	253,157	256,684	9,767			Syston	46	1,5 .1			Broughton As	45	2,810		
Syston	95,892	82,422	3,042			Fleckney	45	3,372			Barrow upon	36	2,367		
	81,125	92,716	3,372				43	1,076			Coult Don't	36	1,426		
Wigston Magna	153,640	166,991	6,858	87,502	72.15%	Measham		1,139	83,433	68.79%		35	1,195	85,108	70.17%
Anstey	19,250	18,889	935			Earl Shilton	44	2,436			Barwell	34	1,100		
Barrow upon Soar	20,750	36,224	1,426			Newbold Verdon	40	1,118			Enderby	34	1,438		
Barwell	30,125	26,015	1,100			Barwell	39	1,100			Glenfield	34	2,579		
Bottesford	17,350	20,904	748			Enderby	37	1,438			Earl Shilton	32	2,436		
Braunstone Town	33,077	37,065	1,525			Ratby	36	808			Groby	32	1,516		
Burbage	16,300	17,778	896			Markfield	34	939			Sileby	32	1,063		
Castle Donington	31,530	34,946	1,195			Castle Donington	32	1,195			Mountsorrel	31	1,541		
Cosby	12,625	13,679	795			Thurmaston	32	915			Measham	31	1,139		
Countesthorpe	10,950	16,971	744			Birstall	31	2,810			Braunstone 1	31	1,525		
Desford	18,250	21,916	841			Braunstone Town	28	1,525			Market Bosw	30	1,092		
East Goscote	18,300	16,100	547			Kegworth	28	853			Rothley	30	970		
Enderby	36,743	34,051	1,438			Groby	26	1,516			Ratby	29	808		
Fleckney	34,075	20,483	1,076			Stoney Stanton	26	591			Kegworth	29	853		
Glenhills	7,152	10,768	603			Glenfield	25	2,579			Desford	29	841		
Great Glen	13,375	12,020	482			Anstey	24	935			Quorn	29	752		
Groby	26,125	31,568	1,516			Desford	24	841			Newbold Ver	28	1,118		
Hathern	4,400	6,396	216			Ibstock	24				Ibstock	28	497		
Ibstock	14,575	17,041	497			Kibworth	24	1,054			Bottesford	28	748		
Kegworth	18,100	18,778	853			Bottesford	23				Fleckney	27	1,076		
Kibworth	21,150	22,217	1,054			Burbage	23				Kirby Muxloe	27	1,197		
Kirby Muxloe	18,012	26,643	1,197			Sileby	23	1,063			Thurmaston	26	915		
Leicester Forest East						Barrow upon Soar	21	1,426			Countesthor		744		
Market Bosworth	20,607	26,681	1,344			Great Glen	21	482			Markfield	26			
Markfield	15,300	27,022	1,092			Leicester Forest East	20				Kibworth	25	939		
Measham	30,949	22,346	939				19	1,544			Burbage	25	1,054		
Mountsorrel	37,534	26,251	1,139			Cosby East Goscote	19	,,,,			Leicester For	25	896		
	48,133	31,132	1,541			East Goscote		347				25	1,344		
Narborough	13,250	16,222	699			Narborough	19	033			Anstey	24	935		
Newbold Verdon	35,625	25,166	1,118			Kirby Muxloe	18	1,137			Stoney Stant	23	591		
Quorn	10,700	20,437	752			Sapcote	18				Narborough	23	699		
Ratby	26,757	22,021	808			Countesthorpe	17	744			Cosby	21	795		
Rothley	13,775	23,780	970			Market Bosworth	17	1,092			Great Glen	18	482		
Sapcote	11,525	9,575	370			Rothley	17	970			East Goscote	17	547		
Sileby	19,575	27,043	1,063			Quorn	15	752			South Wigsto	17	756		
South Wigston	8,975	11,177	756			South Wigston	14	756			Glenhills	17	603		
Stoney Stanton	17,025	14,661	591			Glenhills	11	603			Sapcote	15	370		
Thurmaston	27,280	21,829	915	33,781	27.85%	Hathern	10	216	37,850	31.21%	Hathern	14	216	36,175	29.83%
		Total Borrowe	ers Served	121,283			Total Borro	owers Served	121,283			Total Borrow	ers Served	121,283	

Table 5: Analysis of use based upon 2013/14 actuals **Source: LCC management information**

Current proposals for :	16 funded Lib usage	raries based u	pon annual			16 funded libraries b	ased upon	average visits	per hour		16 funded libraries b	oased upon	Average loar	s per hour	
Library Visits Loans Active borro	Active borrowers served		Library	Visits per hour	Active Borrowers	Active borrowers served		Library	Loans per hour	Active Borrowers	Active borrowers served				
Ashby	108,659	97,369	4,182			Hinckley	108	9,706			Hinckley	99	9,706		
		92,291				Coalville	104	6,243			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	95	9,700		
Blaby Earl Shilton	73,906 62,875	·	4,146				92	·			Loughborough Oadby	89	9,710		
		50,175	2,406			Loughborough	1	9,266			,	69			
Shepshed	53,888	57,773	2,547			Market Harborough	83	5,835			Coalville	09	6,243		
Lutterworth	CO 220	07 207	2 220			Ondhu	00	0.710			Wigston Magna	F0	F 20C		
Contra	60,330	87,287	3,229			Oadby	80	9,710			Anlaha	58	5,306		
Syston	54,602	82,964	3,153			Melton	67	5,203			Ashby	56	4,182		
Broughton Astley	52,649	54,102	2,128			Ashby	62	4,182			Melton	56	5,203		
Birstall	42,104	66,924	2,556			Wigston Magna	55	5,306			Market Harborough	55	5,835		
Glenfield	36,450	50,237	2,254			Blaby	42	4,146			Blaby	53	4,146		
Hinckley	255,660	234,174	9,706			Barwell	36	917			Lutterworth	50	3,229		
Coalville	246,557	163,545	6,243			Earl Shilton	36	2,406			Syston	47	3,153		
Loughborough	237,052	245,198	9,266			Shepshed	35	2,547			Shepshed	38	2,547		
Market Harborough	168,400	111,100	5,835			Lutterworth	34	3,229			Birstall	38	2,556		
Oadby	204,865	229,060	9,710			Measham	32	1,105			Measham	37	1,105		
Melton	158,494	134,010	5,203			Enderby	31	1,189			Barrow upon Soar	36	1,247		
Wigston Magna	97,162	102,792	5,306	77,870	72.41%	•	31	3,153	74,143	68 94%	Castle Donington	34	1,107	74,541	69.31%
Anstey	16,250	18,609	865	77,070	72.41/0	Broughton Astley	30	2,128	74,143	00.54/0	Ibstock	34	476	74,341	03.31/
Barrow upon Soar	13,925	35,957	1,247			Ratby	29	730			Enderby	32	1,189		
	27,550	20,989	917			Newbold Verdon	28	913			Broughton Astley	31	2,128		
Barwell						Markfield	27	911							
Bottesford	11,625	19,334	595								Groby	31	1,283		
Braunstone Town	30,762	34,095	1,370			Braunstone Town	26	1,370			Sileby	31	916		
Burbage	12,625	16,976	783			Kegworth	26	683			Earl Shilton	29	2,406		
Castle Donington	24,838	34,070	1,107			Mountsorrel	26	1,443			Glenfield	29	2,254		
Cosby	9,450	13,311	572			Castle Donington	25	1,107			Market Bosworth	29	755		
Countesthorpe	9,150	17,704	689			Fleckney	24 24	874			Braunstone Town	28 28	1,370		
Desford Fact Casesta	16,025	19,800	725			Groby	_	1,283			Mountsorrel		1,443		
East Goscote	4,375	13,398	467			Birstall	24	2,556			Rothley	28	872		
Enderby	31,325	32,180	1,189			Desford	21	725			Barwell	27	917		
Fleckney	18,350	20,254	874			Glenfield	21	2,254			Countesthorpe	27	689		
Glenhills	7,656	7,763	459			Anstey	20	865			Fleckney	27	874		
Great Glen	7,725	11,744	450			Burbage	18	783			Newbold Verdon	27	913		
Groby	24,275	31,247	1,283			Ibstock	18	476			Quorn	27	620		
Hathern	3,325	5,971	284			Leicester Forest East	17	1,283			Bottesford	26	595		
Ibstock	10,600	20,325	476			Bottesford	16	595			Desford	26	725		
Kegworth	16,625	16,222	683			Kirby Muxloe	16	1,218			Narborough	26	627		
Kibworth	12,800	21,184	918			Cosby	15	572			Kegworth	25	683		
Kirby Muxloe	16,489	24,201	1,218			Narborough	15	627			Leicester Forest East	25	1,283		
Leicester Forest East	17,704	26,566	1,283			Thurmaston	15	827			Thurmaston	25	827		
Market Bosworth	12,100	25,910	755			Barrow upon Soar	14	1,247			Burbage	24	783		
Markfield	23,956	20,852	911			Countesthorpe	14	689			Kibworth	24	918		
Measham	27,592	31,278	1,105			Kibworth	14	918			Kirby Muxloe	24	1,218		
Mountsorrel	26,213	28,290	1,443			South Wigston	14	613			Ratby	24	730		
Narborough	10,825	18,370	627			Market Bosworth	13	755			Anstey	23	865		
Newbold Verdon	25,425	23,924	913			Rothley	13	872			Markfield	23	911		
Quorn	6,775	19,051	620			Sileby	13	916			Stoney Stanton	21	575		
Ratby	21,700	17,991	730			Glenhills	12	459			Cosby	20	572		
Rothley	10,000	22,628	872			Great Glen	12	450			Great Glen	18	450		
Sapcote	5,425	9,533	314			Quorn	10	620			Sapcote	15	314		
Sileby	11,075	26,342	916			Stoney Stanton	10	575			South Wigston	15	613		
South Wigston	9,350	9,909	613			Sapcote	8	314			East Goscote	14	467		
Stoney Stanton	6,350	13,830	575			Hathern	7	284			Hathern	13	284		
	12,905	21,481	827	29,675		East Goscote	5	467	33,402	21 069/	Glenhills	12	459	22 004	30.69%

^{15.} Tables 4 and 5 demonstrate that although the configuration of 16 libraries is slightly different if visits per hour and loans per hour are used as the prime criteria, more

active borrowers are served if annual loans, i.e. access to the book lending service are used to establish the 16 highest used libraries.

Conclusion

- 16. In a very difficult climate the County Council seeks to protect as many service users as it can when making decisions that involve reductions in available resources. The current proposal for LCC funded libraries protects the maximum number of active users.
- 17. It may be suggested that if data such as visits per hour open and loans per hour open are exclusively used, then a different configuration of libraries could be constructed to determine 16 libraries to be fully funded by the county council. Consideration should be given however to the exceptional circumstances outlined in paragraphs 7 and 8 that impacted on some shopping centre and market town libraries during 2013/14.
- 18. When active borrowers and annual loans are considered in conjunction with average usage as detailed in paragraphs 10-13 the rationale for identifying the libraries proposed to be fully funded by the County Council remains as originally proposed.
- 19. This is further supported by the results from the consultation that shows that the core book lending and loan service is felt to be the most valued and important aspect of the service. Tables 4 and 5 illustrate that more active borrowers will be able to access the service through the originally proposed 16 libraries, than by different configurations based on criteria where the highest community libraries perform better than the lowest shopping centre libraries, e.g. average visits per hour and average loans per hour.

This page is intentionally left blank